

STEVENSON-CARSON SCHOOL DISTRICT

Cost Benefit Analysis

July 16, 2019

The Stevenson-Carson School District's long-range facility planning committee developed the preferred and recommended facility improvement concept that it feels best meets the educational needs of the District and Community in the most cost-effective manner and approach. The following is an opinion of school facility improvement costs based on recent construction market information, conditions, apparent trends and industry observations. As a result of the Long-Range Planning Process, the School District and planning committee are looking at facility improvements that include combinations of modernization/ renovation/ remodel and new building additions in a capacity that will reduce overall project cost in an effort to provide an overall affordable facilities improvement plan.

Facility Improvement Project Approach:

It is acknowledged that new construction has many benefits over modernization/ remodel of existing buildings and facilities. The planning committee recommends that the District follow in the direction of modernization/ remodel and new additions approach for affordability as opposed to the high cost of the new construction approach. This cost benefit analysis relates mainly to the general comparison of basic modernization construction versus basic replacement of school facilities with new construction. Cost opinion Information shown below includes new construction for the facility replacement costs. This data shows that modernization/remodel projects are often comparable and sometimes more costly than new construction. Some primary factors leading to this outcome includes the difficulty of providing educational facilities that can properly support 21st Century learning models in older facilities as well as the priority Life Safety & Code related upgrades. Other main factors lie with the complexities and unknowns of modifying existing structures compared to the straightforward, sequential, and standardized practices of new construction. With this in mind, the planning committee is recommending to keep the level of modernization scope to a medium to lower level and toward the lower end of the cost ranges indicated as opposed to the new construction costs indicated.

The following cost opinions provide rough order of magnitude for the purposes of evaluating the options for appropriate facility improvement approaches. The costs indicated include a range to accommodate various factors for yet to be determined levels of scope, relative market costs and project timetables etc. Costs indicated are Construction Only and do not include Soft Costs (+/- 30%), Escalation Factors or Taxes. It must also be made clear that recent market conditions have proven extremely unpredictable and difficult to forecast, and therefore these cost ranges should only be used to assess appropriate methods of project approach.

Facility Improvements for Modernization or Replacement:

1. **Option 1**

This Option follows the combination of New plus Modernization plus New Additions Path.

Basic Concept:

New ES on HS Site + New MS on HS Site + Selective Upgrades at HS + SD Facility @ Stevenson

Summary:

- This concept includes the creation of a combined New Elementary School Facility on the existing HS site South end while abandoning the existing Carson Elementary School Building as an educational facility (Carson building will have a potential utilization for Community use).
- This option includes providing a New Middle School building on the existing High School Site with certain shared facilities on site and or integrated to some degree as determined advantageous for efficiency. This connection might be for a shared, but divided Core Facility and Admin. areas.
- This option includes selective modernization and upgrades to the existing High School.
- This option includes moving the existing District Facilities to the Stevenson ES Building and Site.

1.1. Adding a major new addition that could include two story as a portion or in entirety.

HS New Additions:

Approx. area = 47,000 sf @ \$425 - 500/sf -----	\$19,975,000	-
	\$23,500,000	

1.2. Includes modernizing all existing high school facilities that remain.

HS Modernization/ Remodel:

Approx. area = 68,000 sf @ \$375 - 450/sf -----	\$25,500,000	-
	\$30,600,000	

1.3. Include a new middle school building that would be connected to the high school building and would likely be multi-story. This requires new related sitework.

New MS:

Approx. area = 45,000 sf @ \$425 - 500/sf -----	\$19,125,000	-
	\$22,500,000	

1.4. Include a new elementary school building that would be connected to core building facility integrated with the MS but on a different floor level. This requires new related sitework.

New ES:

Approx. area = 48,000 sf @ \$425 - 500/sf -----	\$20,400,000	-
	\$24,000,000	

1.5. Includes new transportation addition to Stevenson ES & site.

Stevenson ES Addition:

Approx. area = 8,000 sf @ \$275 - 325/sf -----	\$2,200,000	-
	\$2,600,000	

1.6. Includes relocating district offices, transportation & other SD facilities to Stevenson ES & site.
Stevenson ES Remodel:

Approx. area = 12,000 sf @ \$100 - 150/sf -----\$1,200,000 -
 \$1,800,000

1.7. Demo Carson ES, Maintain Athletic Fields and option to lease the old WREC building.
 \$1,000,000 - \$1,200,000

Total -----**\$89,400,000** -
\$106,200,000

2. Option 2

This Option follows the combination of New School plus Modernization plus New Bldg Addition Path.

Basic Concept:

Combined ES @ Stevenson + New MS on HS Site + Selective Upgrades at High School

Summary:

- This concept includes the creation of a combined Elementary School Facility at the existing Stevenson Elementary location. The existing Elementary facility will require selective modernization with a new Classroom and a Kitchen/ Cafeteria addition.
- This option includes providing a New Middle School building on the existing High School Site with certain shared facilities on site and or integrated building.
- This option includes selective modernization and upgrades to the existing High School which will also gain space form the relocation of the Middle School.

2.1 Adding a major new classroom addition that could include partial two story or entire two story.

HS New Additions:

Approx. area = 64,000 sf @ \$425 - 500/sf -----\$27,200,000 -
 \$32,000,000

2.2 This would include modernizing all existing high school facilities that remain -

HS Modernization/ Remodel:

Approx. area = 43,000 sf @ \$375 - 450/sf -----\$16,125,000 -
 \$19,350,000

2.3 Include a separate new middle school building that would likely be multi-story. This requires new related sitework.

New MS:

Approx. area = 45,000 sf @ \$425 - 500/sf -----\$19,125,000 -
 \$22,500,000

2.4 Add new classroom, athletic & cafeteria addition to Stevenson Elementary School and site.

Stevenson ES Addition:

Approx. area = 24,000 sf @ \$425 - 500/sf -----\$10,200,000 -
 \$12,000,000

2.5 This would include modernizations to portions of existing areas of Stevenson Elementary building & site.

Stevenson ES Modernization/ Remodel:

Approx. area = 6,000 sf @ \$100- 150/sf -----\$600,000 -
 \$900,000

2.6 Demolish Carson Elementary, Maintain Athletic Fields with the option to lease the old WREC building.

\$1,000,000 - \$1,200,000

Total ----- \$73,250,000 - \$87,950,000

3. Option 3

This Option follows the Modernization plus New Building Addition Path.

Basic Concept:

Combined ES @ Stevenson + MS moves to Carson ES + Selective Upgrades at High School

Summary:

- This concept includes the creation of a combined Elementary School Facility at the existing Stevenson Elementary location. The existing Elementary facility will require selective modernization with a new Classroom and a Kitchen/ Cafeteria addition.
- This option includes moving the Middle School to the existing Carson Elementary School facility with a full modernization to existing building areas and new Classroom Addition.
- This option includes selective modernization and upgrades to the existing High School, which will also gain space from the relocation of the Middle School.

3.1 HS New Additions: None identified

Approx. area = 0 sf @ \$425 - 500/sf -----\$0 -
 \$0

3.2 This would include selective modernization upgrades at existing high school facilities - HS Modernization/ Remodel:

Approx. area = 85,000 sf @ \$100 - 150/sf -----\$8,500,000 -
 \$12,750,000

3.3 This would include new modernizations and additions to Carson Elementary School and site. Carson MS Addition:

Approx. area = 15,000 sf @ \$425 - 500/sf -----\$6,375,000 -
 \$7,500,000

3.4 This would include new modernizations and additions to Carson Elementary School and site. Carson MS Modernization/ Remodel:

Approx. area = 49,200 sf @ \$375 - 450/sf ----- \$18,450,000 - \$22,140,000

3.5 Add new classroom, gym & cafeteria addition to Stevenson Elementary School and site. Stevenson ES Addition:

Approx. area = 30,000 sf @ \$425 - 500/sf -----\$12,750,000 -
 \$15,000,000

3.6 This would include modernizations to portions of existing areas of Stevenson Elementary School & site.

Stevenson ES Modernization/ Remodel:
 Approx. area = 6,000 sf @ \$100- 150/sf -----\$600,000 -
 \$900,000

3.7 Option to lease the old WREC building.

Total -----**\$46,675,000** -
 -----**\$58,290,000**

4. Option 4

This Option follows the Modernization plus New Building Addition Path.

Basic Concept:

Combined ES @ Stevenson + Middle School moves to WREC + Selective Upgrades at High School

Summary:

- o This concept includes the creation of a combined Elementary School Facility at the existing Stevenson Elementary location while abandoning the existing Carson Elementary School Building as an educational facility (Carson building will have a potential utilization for Community use). The existing Stevenson Elementary facility will require selective modernization with a new Classroom and a Kitchen/ Cafeteria addition.
- o This option includes moving the Middle School to the existing WREC facility with a full modernization to existing building areas and new Classroom Addition and Kitchen/ Cafeteria Addition.
- o This option includes selective modernization and upgrades to the existing High School, which will also gain space from the relocation of the Middle School.

4.1 HS New Additions: None identified

Approx. area = 0 sf @ \$425 - 500/sf -----\$0 -
 \$0

4.2 This would include selective modernization upgrades at existing high school facilities -

HS Modernization/ Remodel:
 Approx. area = 85,000 sf @ \$100 - 150/sf ----- \$8,500,000 -
 \$12,750,000

4.3 This would include new modernizations and additions to existing WREC facility and site.

Middle School Addition:
 Approx. area = 14,900 sf @ \$425 - 500/sf -----\$6,332,500 -
 \$7,450,000

4.4 This would include new modernizations and additions to existing WREC facility and site. Middle School Modernization/ Remodel:			
Approx. area = 48,730 sf @ \$300 - 400/sf -----	\$14,619,000	-	
	\$19,492,000		
4.5 Add new classroom, athletic & cafeteria addition to Stevenson Elementary School and site. Stevenson ES Addition:			
Approx. area = 30,000 sf @ \$425 - 500/sf -----	\$12,750,000	-	
	\$15,000,000		
4.6 This would include modernizations to portions of existing areas of Stevenson Elementary School & site. Stevenson ES Modernization/ Remodel:			
Approx. area = 6,000 sf @ \$100- 150/sf -----	\$600,000	-	
	\$900,000		
4.7 Optional use of existing Carson Elementary for other uses.			
Total -----	\$42,801,500	-	
	\$55,592,000		

5. Option 5

This Option follows the Modernization plus New Building Addition Path.

Basic Concept:

Combined ES @ WREC + Middle School moves to Stevenson ES + Selective Upgrades at High School

Summary:

- This concept includes the creation of a combined Elementary School Facility at the existing WREC location and opening Stevenson Elementary for the Middle School while abandoning Carson Elementary as a school with potential utilization for Community use. The existing WREC Facility will require complete Modernization and New Additions for Classrooms, Kitchen & Cafeteria.
- This option moves the Middle School from the High School building to the existing Stevenson Elementary facility which will require selective modernization, new Classroom and Gym additions and a Kitchen/ Cafeteria addition.
- This option includes selective modernization and upgrades to the existing High School, which will also gain available space from the relocation of the Middle School.

5.1 HS New Additions: None identified

5.2 This would include selective modernization upgrades at existing high school facilities -

HS Modernization/ Remodel:

Approx. area = 85,000 sf @ \$100 - 150/sf -----	\$8,500,000	-
	\$12,750,000	

5.3 New Additions to existing WREC facility and site.

New Elementary Additions:

Approx. area = 30,000 sf @ \$425 - 500/sf -----	\$12,750,000	-
	\$15,000,000	
5.4 Modernization to existing WREC facility and site.		
Elementary Modernization - Medium Level:		
Approx. area = 29,000 sf @ \$300 - 400/sf -----	\$8,700,000	-
	\$11,600,000	
Elementary Modernization - Light Level:		
Approx. area = 19,500 sf @ \$100 - 150/sf -----	\$1,950,000	-
	\$2,925,000	
5.5 Add new classroom, athletic & cafeteria addition to Stevenson Elementary School.		
New Elementary Additions:		
Approx. area = 11,800 sf @ \$425 - 500/sf -----	\$5,015,000	-
	\$5,900,000	
5.6 Modernization to portions of existing areas at Stevenson Elementary & site for relocated Middle School.		
Middle School Medium Modernization:		
Approx. area = 1,670 sf @ \$375 - 450/sf -----	\$626,250	-
	\$751,500	
Middle School Light Modernization:		
Approx. area = 1,100 sf @ \$100- 150/sf -----	\$110,000	-
	\$165,000	
5.7 Optional use of existing Carson Elementary for other non-educational uses.		TBD
Total -----	\$30,001,250	-
<u>\$49,091,500</u>		

Above information includes rough order of magnitude opinions of cost for value & cost benefit and comparison analysis purposes.